# UNION TOWNSHIP BOARD OF EDUCATION WORKSESSION MINUTES – SEPTEMBER 13, 2016

The worksession meeting of the Board of Education of the Township of Union was held on Tuesday, September 13, 2016 at 7:00 p.m. at the James Caulfield Administration Building, 2369 Morris Avenue, Union, New Jersey. Action was taken.

Mr. Nufrio called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

## PRESENT AT ROLL CALL:

Mr. David Arminio, Dr. Guy Francis, Mr. Steven Le, Mr. Ron McDowell, Mr. Jeffrey Monge, Mr. Vito Nufrio, Mr. Angel Salcedo, Mrs. Nancy Zuena

### ABSENT AT ROLL CALL:

Mrs. Nellis Regis-Darby

## ADMINISTRATORS PRESENT:

Mr. Gregory Tatum, Mrs. Annie Moses, Mrs. Sandra Paul, Mrs. Kim Conti, Mr. Barry Loessel, Mr. Gerry Benaquista, Mr. Gregory Brennan

## ALSO PRESENT:

Mr. Paul Griggs, Esq.

Mr. Brennan led the Board and audience members in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mr. Brennan read the statement required under the "Open Public Meetings Act", a copy of which is on file in the office of the Board Secretary.

## COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC ON RESOLUTIONS IN BOLD: None

Mrs. Regis-Darby arrived at 7:05 p.m.

## APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Mr. Nufrio stated that the minutes listed on the agenda would be approved at next week's meeting.

## COMMUNICATIONS:

Mr. Arminio stated that the communications which are part of P-3 and P-4 will be approved this evening.

## REQUEST OF VAUXHALL HISTORICAL SOCIETY

Request of Vauxhall Historical Society requesting permission to use Jefferson Elementary School gym for the Veterans' Day Program – November 5, 2016 from 10 a.m. to 2 p.m. and request the waiver of fees.

## LETTER FROM SCIARRILLO ET AL

Letter from Sciarrillo Cornell Merlino, McKeever & Osborne.

## REQUEST FOR PAID MEDICAL LEAVE - HIGGINS

Request for paid medical leave from Kelly Higgins, teacher-Connecticut Farms Elementary School, for the period from September 1, 2016 through October 14, 2016.

## REQUEST FOR PAID MATERNITY LEAVE - REGUINHO

Request for paid maternity leave from Jennifer Reguinho, kindergarten teacher-Hannah Caldwell Elementary School, effective November 4, 2016 with a return date of January 17, 2017.

## LETTER OF RESIGNATION – JENKINS

Letter of resignation from Jermel Jenkins, instructional paraprofessional-Franklin Elementary School, effective September 1, 2016.

## LETTER OF RESIGNATION (CAFÉ' AIDE POSITION ONLY) - PIGGOT

Letter of resignation (café aide position only) from Ann Maria Piggot, café aide-Jefferson School, effective immediately.

## LETTER OF RESIGNATION – GREEN

Letter of resignation from Brielle Green, café aide-Jefferson School, effective September 1, 2016.

## REQUEST FOR PAID MEDICAL LEAVE - STEEB

Request for paid medical leave concurrently with FMLA, from Linda Steeb-teacher-Kawameeh Middle School, for the period from September 1, 2016 through September 23, 2016 (tentative).

## REQUEST FOR PAID MEDICAL LEAVE - ROMEO

Request for paid medical leave from Matthew Romeo, teacher-Jefferson School, for the period from September 2, 2016 through September 23, 2016.

## LETTER OF RESIGNATION - SMITH KELLON

Letter of resignation from Jo Smith Kellon, instructional paraprofessional-Connecticut Farms Elementary School, effective September 1, 2016.

## LETTER OF RESIGNATION - DENNIS

Letter of resignation from Gabriell Dennis, Café Aide-Jefferson School, effective September 1, 2016.

## REQUEST FROM LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF UNION

Request from the League of Women Voters of Union to use Union High School Library for a televised Candidates Debate on either Monday, October 24, 2016 from 7 p.m. to 10 p.m.

## SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT:

Mr. Tatum stated welcome back to those we haven't seen all summer long. There are a number of presentations tonight. The District opened up last week very successfully. We had a very nice program on the first day with the faculty, a dynamite guest speaker and I think we are off to a very good start.

Next week I will talk a little bit more about our opening and also some of the highlights that we had so far this month. I will probably talk about District public relationships in my report.

Tonight we have many presentations tonight and begin the presentations with Effective School Solutions followed by our presentations of health brokers.

Mr. Nufrio stated you said we had a dynamic speaker at the districtwide assembly of all our staff and I just want to publicly indicate that Mrs. Moses needs to be complemented and this is the second time I'm complementing you for the same one. The word dynamic is perhaps an understatement. I thought so much of that speaker that I did ask if we could get the presentation distributed to all the staff and the Board. Mrs. Moses stated the staff got a copy and the Board will get a copy tomorrow. Mr. Nufrio stated the guy was amazing. The presentation was combined with a power point and certainly you can't duplicate what he said and all of the various anecdotes that he brought to light but I thought it was so dynamic and professional that I wanted to have the entire District share in that. I also indicated that perhaps we can have him return mid-year to do a little energizing for our staff. I just wanted to say again "thank you Mrs. Moses and whoever helped you with that".

We are going to do Effective Solutions for the prospective brokers in the room, what we will do is as we do each one I will ask that the other two kindly step out of the room so there is a little bit more privacy so we will call upon you to do that.

<u>Presentation by Effective School Solutions</u> (therapeutic mental health services:

Mrs. Conti stated Effective Schools Solutions are here and as you all know they did a presentation to the Education Committee in the spring and in June they did a presentation to the Board and so we invited them back tonight for those who have any questions. They will give a quick overview of their program again for the benefit of those that did not get a chance to hear their presentation.

Dr. Nyman stated I am the founder of Effective School Solutions. We provide clinical psychiatric services to work with students with significant emotional problems and to prevent them from going out of district and being able to benefit from everything the district can provide and be able to graduate from the school district. We do that in a number of ways that we reviewed. We do clinical programing, we do a lot of in-service training for the educational staff, we support a culture of allowing the student to be maintained in the district.

What I do have for you is updated data. When I did the presentation, the data was from two years ago because they just started to summarize in June. Mr. Nyman handed out information; same is appended to the minutes.

We are very driven organization. We track every student who has been in Effective School Solutions and we present this data to all of our districts on a twice a year basis. This is an aggregate of the entire organization. In here, we track three things on page 1. We worked last year with 888 students throughout our programming. Last year we were in 42 schools and 27 school districts and this year we are in 55 schools and 34 school districts in Connecticut and New Jersey. We worked with 888 students and only 24 of the students ended up going out of district which is about 2-3/4% of the students that we work with and we work with many students at risk. We do a lot of work to return students that are out of district to come back into our program and we support them as they integrate back into the school system. Last year we brought 41 students back during the course of the year to come back into the schools and programs and only 2 of the 41 didn't make it and went back out of district.

Our work with students that are on extended home instruction; we have a lot of districts where students, for a number of reasons, are in extended home instruction and obviously is not to their benefit or the districts benefit. We brought 56 students back from extended home instruction and 3 of those students did not make it and ended up going back to extended home instruction. You can see that the data says a lot about the impact on students within the context of being able to stay within the district.

If you look at the next page, it looks at the individual students performance. We look at their grades, their disciplinary incidences and their absences and we always look at how they did compared to the marketing period before they entered our programs and this is the data for the entire school year. As you can, once a student enters our programs, the disciplinary incidences go down by 74%, their absences go down by 50% and their grades go up by 33%.

The way we summarize what I just said was once the student enters our program, they behave better, they show up more frequently, their grades get a lot better and they won't need to leave the district -2-1/2% do. That is the updated data that I talked about in our last meeting.

Does anyone have any questions? Mr. Salcedo stated does it imply that having less children go out of district that the cost of services going out of district is going to drop. Mr. Nyman stated it is not implied, it is overt. Mr. Salcedo stated do you have data showing that what districts are saving by taking the program internal to the district. Mr. Nyman stated it varies with the district and how many students they had before. A case example is when we entered Cherry Hill, which is a large school system, they had an alternative school where they took their kids that had significant conduct problems and kids with psychiatric problems would go out of district. They were spending \$3 million on sending the kids out but not including the conduct kids. Three years after we were there, they spend \$0 on out of district placements for psychiatric or behavioral programs. What we did there was re-invent their alternative school to work with both psychiatric and behavioral students.

In the areas that are close to around here we are in a number of districts – in Montclair, we are in their high school, their 9<sup>th</sup> grade academy and three of their middle schools. We started there five years ago. We are in South Orange/Maplewood, Westfield, Scotch Plains, Morristown – we are in a lot of different districts and I would like to say they always bring us back over and over because of the impact that we make on the individual children and that is true but the truth is we save them a lot of money in their budget by dramatically reducing out of district placements. If you think about the cost of an out of district placement, if you send a kid out of district it can be anywhere between \$40-\$80,000 not including the transportation cost, so with transportation \$100,000. If you look at what we do and we prevent 1-2 kids from going out of district, it covers the costs of the programs because when a student goes out of district, they don't come back three months later. They are out 2-3 years. It really makes quite an impact and that is why the districts bring us back.

Mr. Monge stated obviously we have a proposal in front of us, I understand the services and we can ask questions about that but we have a proposal in front of us and can we ask questions as it pertains to the proposal and as far as our decision to have you guys here, are we able to ask that question as well. This seems like it should be a holistic conversation about the program, the proposal in front of us, why they are here and the like. If we move on to our session and we ask the question and they are not able to answer. I'm just trying to understand.

Mr. Nufrio stated let's keep it focused on questions that pertain to the actual program. I have one and I believe you did answer it at one time. This does require parental permission and my question is two-fold and you may not be able to answer so I will put it to Mr. Griggs. Along with the cost of out of district placement, there will also be the possibility that legal entitlements can result from a parent who says I don't want my child staying here because you don't have the services that we expect and you can't provide those services. Mr. Griggs what can we expect from that? Mr. Griggs stated if they take exception to the placement, then it would be a typical due process. I think I would be concerned about the question would you folks get involved in any type of special ed legal matters. Mr. Nymann stated we work in a number of districts that have a lot of lawyers working against the district and our services are rather unique and a parent wants to make a unilateral placement and the child has not been in our program, we work with you or whoever it is and we do depositions. We will describe our programs because when you think about what we provide, our position is a child deserves the opportunity to enter into our program before they are forced to go out of district or going out of district because if a child is in our program, and it is an intensive clinical programs, and doesn't make it then we are the first to say let's support that child going out of district. But if we can make a service that makes a difference for the student, that is the position that we take in the litigation and we will testify and do all that stuff. Mr. Nufrio stated and that is embedded within the cost. Mr. Nyman stated it is all included. We have done that a number of times.

Dr. Francis stated your organization works with our special education department. Mr. Nyman stated yes but not exclusively, it is the district's individual decision. Many of our districts we work with non-classified as well as classified students. Dr. Francis stated how many faculty or licensed clinical social workers? Mr. Nymann stated the team that we provide for you to start with is a 4-member team. They will have extensive experience working with psychiatric and behavioral problems. Not in the schools — working in the psychiatric treatment facilities.

We are really the marriage in the psychiatric world and the educational world and we are infusing into the education world the psychiatric expertise. We will have those 2 full-time mental health professionals, a regional clinical supervisor and that is a very senior person within the organization that oversees about four districts at a time and they will be here at least 1-2 times a week working as well with the school leadership and the department leadership. The fourth is a member of quality management team and their job is what I call the secret police. They are monitoring to make sure that we are doing everything we are telling you that we are doing. The 2 full-time people are the ones that are carrying the caseloads.

Dr. Francis asked why haven't the other districts adopted what you are doing — hiring the same type of people who are actually carrying out those duties. Mr. Nymann stated we are not simply bringing you in therapists. We are bringing in an entire set of protocols, programs, expertise and experience that creates this model of services. If you look in the package that we gave you, it describes a whole series of things that we do that are unique that to be honest a school district couldn't provide. The level of supervision, the treatment protocols — we just don't tell the therapist to come in and do what you want, there are very detailed protocols that we developed that structure exactly on how we run our programs because that is the way that we know we get that result. It is not just a feel good thing. It is a whole structured program and these protocols are rather unique. The family programs are different than what you are going to be able to create and there are a whole series of things that we do that are different and marrying this expertise within the school world. We do a lot of training with the teaching staff to help support them.

Representative from ESS stated you need to understand who we are and David worked for behavioral health and I worked with him there and that is what we did exclusively and some work in therapeutic schools also understand the school world. This is the purest of all that work because you are keeping the kids in district. These are tier 3 interventions. When you get to that level of special ed, that is a unique individual; that is a kid who is on the verge of going out. The expertise must be there at that level of intervention and that is where ESS comes in. All the other stuff is triage and we will work with that triage system so people who are really good and you have great counselors already but the kid is not at that level, we are still going to refer those students and then after we see them and then we are going to refer them back. It is when we get into that high tier level that you really need to know what is going on in terms of behavioral health – the purest sense of it. When you start tapping into that and you don't have all the pieces that David had mentioned, then you are dealing with something where something can happen. Whereas we are very comfortable in that tier 3 world and that is why students end up being successful. Over time, parents build equity with ESS. They want their kids in these programs, they are no longer fighting with the Child Study Team. They are seeing ESS as this is a wonderful thing that the district brought in and gave to our kids. That is why we are in 55 different schools.

Mrs. Conti stated I have spoken to directors that have the programs and wholeheartedly endorse it and they have seen an increase in attendance, grades, a drop in out of district and we heard about the monetary piece but the big piece is the benefits to the students – that they are here in the least restrictive environment and they are coming back to their own school

community. The very community that when they graduate and go out into the world that they will be working in.

 $\{j=\hat{\xi}\}$ 

Dr. Nymann stated that the line that I always use is ESS is a win-win-win. It is a win for the student, the student gets to stay in the district and our position is no matter how good the therapeutic school is, it never comes close to what a public school system can provide socially, academically on every level, so it is a win for the student and it is a win for the parents. You will have parents that have a difficult relationship with the district and once the student enters ESS, it changes because of the services that the district is providing to that family. Mrs. Conti stated and that is what the other directors had said how much the parents do support it and really like the program. Mr. Nymann stated it is a win for the district from both a least restrictive environment and a purely budgetary perspective. I would like it always to be about making a difference for the students but changing the budget makes it a lot easier on every level for the district.

Mr. Monge stated in the proposal you have 18 students. Why 18? How are the 18 selected? Dr. Nymann stated I would love to say 25. We do these internal time studies and looking at what our staff does and how much time is devoted to each student and that is how we came up with 18. I can't tell you when the program is full at 18 and the Director of Special Services or the Principal comes and says can you help me with one other kid, we say yes and find a way to squeeze him in; but 18 is really the number.

Mr. Monge stated how are the 18 selected? Dr. Nymann stated it is led by the district. Mrs. Conti stated it is IEP team driven – the IEP team would decide the placement. Mr. Monge stated that wasn't 100% clear so maybe we can flush that out with some other language. As far as the price for the contract, I actually did a little research and I saw and it seems like you have a boilerplate contract that you guys use and I see prices. Dr. Nymann stated every year 2%. Mr. Monge stated I saw one that was a much bigger number and obviously that is good for us since our number is lower than that. How do you justify that and what are the service goals and outcomes that we are going to match up.

Dr. Nymann stated the goals we'll be able to sit here next year and show you the data for your programs and show you that we have prevented out of district placements and help students get back and get much better grades and attendance. You are going to get a version of that report for your district so you will feel comfortable that there is an objective measurement.

Mr. Monge stated can you explain your payment schedule because that wasn't 100% clear. Dr. Nymann stated we get paid once a month. 90% of the time we begin in September and you get  $1/10^{th}$  per month. If we begin in October or November, it gets pro-rated.

Mr. Nufrio stated Mrs. Conti I think this is a follow-up to what you said with regards to the 18 selected. Can you tell the Board and the Superintendent how many cases in this past year that you had to deal with out of district placement and how has that changed over the past three years because I think that is important to know what we are getting into. If you say to me we only had five out of district replacements, I would be a little hard pressed to be convinced that we need these services.

Dr. Nyman stated before you answer that let me describe the 18 students that tend to be in our program as a general profile. Districts rarely start with 18, they usually start at 10-13 because they want to be able to add students throughout the year. Mr. Nufrio stated but it maxes out at 18. Dr. Nyman stated I don't want to mislead anybody and say 18 are teetering on going out of district. It is not. Usually it is anywhere between 3-10 kids that would go out of district if we weren't present. The others are benefitting greatly from our program because they need the services. The cost is covered.

Mr. Nufrio stated thank you for that but Mrs. Conti can you enlighten this Board as to what has been the number of students and cases over the past three years. Mr. Monge stated or this year. Mr. Nufrio stated I would like to hear the past three years. Mrs. Conti stated just talking back historically with the out of district placement numbers, when I first came on board, there were least restrictive environment and the State performance plan indicators on the NJDOE website and you have to mindful of how many students you have and what you call segregated settings which means more restrictive placements, smaller classrooms, out of district and at that time we built a lot of programs in the district and we brought it down to 180 and we brought it down in the years to 113. We began to see it creeping up to 120. Now you are looking at this past year and we jumped up another 20 in out-of-district placements.

Mr. Nufrio asked what would the average be over the past three years. Mrs. Conti stated in the one year – 20 students, which was the biggest jump this year, so you are talking 20 x \$100,000 on average. Mrs. Zuena stated how many total students in the district. Mrs. Conti stated about 140. Mr. Nufrio stated I'm still interested in knowing – 20 this year, how many last year and the year before. Mr. Conti stated you could see them going up by 5, by 10 and then before you know it we had the biggest jump this year to 20. I don't have the exact number from last year but I can get that for you.

Mr. Arminio asked how many of those would fit the profile necessary to be in this program from this year. Mrs. Conti stated about 10. Mr. Nufrio stated because the other 10 is really much less, because of the ADA regulations that would make them eligible and what the program fits.

Mr. Monge asked is this budgeted? Mrs. Conti stated when we have looked at this, this is private tuitions we are looking at. If you have children that are at risk of going out of district and being able to maintain them, you would have that cost savings and benefit. Mr. Monge stated the question is — is it budgeted? It is in our budget for this year. Mrs. Conti stated the actual program was not in the December budget at that time, what I am saying we are finding where the funds can be supported as when we came to the Education Committee when I was asked that question, I said it would come mostly from the tuition side because that is where we are funding it from.

Mr. Monge stated so what you are saying is your hope is to save and the savings would pay for it but you would come out of pocket first. Are you saying that you would fund by trying to find money within your current budget. Mrs. Conti stated yes because it is like building programs, you have to have the program here first before you bring the kids in but as I did with the programs in the past when we built them in district, you have to know who the population is

and how many children can benefit from this. It may not be everyone that you project, but you have an idea and I have done this over the years and then you bring them back and you have the program in place and you know what you are projecting out because I can tell you that the number you start with in September is not where you are in June. Inevitably that number of the years you do see the trend where you start with one number and it is higher by June.

Mrs. Regis-Darby asked is that because we don't have proper Tier 1 and Tier 2 intervention? Mrs. Conti stated what I would say to you is it is also because we have built a lot of programs in district and there is space factors and are you talking about special ed programs, are you talking about preventative side? Mrs. Regis-Darby stated both. Mrs. Conti stated for in district we maxed out our space availability and now on the IR&S side, they are working toward the tiered intervention. Once they are with me here in our department and they are receiving special ed and related services, there are all different types of instruction in the whole cascade of services that children receive and you start with the least restrictive and go all the way down to the most restrictive. You don't want to start with least restrictive out to the more restrictive settings. Within my department, we have different types of interventions and as far as outside of the IR&S they work with different evaluation plans as well.

Dr. Nymann stated the important thing to also understand about the Tier 1 is that this is not an educational program, this is a different type of expertise that you will be bringing into your school system. There are students no matter how great your staff and I have met a lot of the child study team people and you have a group of very motivated and skilled people but that doesn't matter, this is a different type of expertise and program that will make a difference for the student that no matter how good the Tier 1 or Tier 2 intervention are, you can't do it because it is too serious of a problem and too disruptive of the school.

Representative of ESS stated there is a reason why in the continuum of care in mental health and you have outpatient therapists, intensive outpatient programs, partial hospital programs, inpatient and residential programs that would make sense for schools who are facing having to pay for that would be able to offset that by having somethings in place up to the third tier which could really offset it.

Dr. Nymann stated to talk about the budget and we deal with 34 different school districts and budgets and when they jump start the programs, they do it in one of two ways. They do it by having it in the budget in the beginning which is rare. 80% of the time, they take money from the tuition budget line and move it over to cover it and then the following year it is a separate budget item.

Mr. Monge stated I appreciate that feedback but we don't have that. We have had this presented to us and we didn't have that full picture so we are just trying to get pieces of the puzzle and put it together and it hasn't been clear.

Mr. Nufrio asked how are you perceived by the ADA regulations in terms of which supplemental service and I understand mental health, but we do have mental health facilities that we do send our children to both regular and special ed. How do you fit into that plan that the

ADA is looking at us to fulfill. How are you perceived by them? Dr. Nymann stated I have no idea. I have never been asked that question before.

Mrs. Conti stated it still goes back to what we were saying before, it is the level of care. Although there are counseling services and different mental health services, it is all the levels of care and it brings another perspective, another program to supply support to the children. In the Department of Special Education, we have a cascade of services and it adds one more dimension to offer our students to help them be successful here and that is really important here. I know money is important and things don't work without money, but we have to think about the students and what it means to them and their self-esteem if they can be successful here. We have done this over time with different programs and I can tell you as you said, the public school system is often the best place where we can bring our children to with the expertise of our staff here and as long as it is the right support and these folks have the credentials that is needed for that next level of care which we don't have here to provide.

Mr. Nufrio stated the reason why I asked that of course is because we deal with tax dollars so we are responsible for the taxpayer which we are also. In essence my concern is are we justified in your perception of the entire situation of out of district placement to spend this amount because it is supplemental to what we currently do but the caveat is we stand to reap the benefit of reducing the cost. It is a multiple justification. Mrs. Conti stated it is a cost benefit. As they said before, it is a win-win. If we can do more with our funds in this district by supporting students to be successful here, we can even do more for all students and I can see the potential for this with the professional development that they provide and we will have a spill over affect to other staff members. If we train staff here and even if everyone in this room doesn't deal with every child that might be in ESS, you have the spill over benefit of that professional development working with all children – gen ed, other special ed students and that is important that we are not only going to get with the students you are talking about but also that spill over affect that I see.

Mrs. Regis-Darby asked are the PD's covered by the fees and is it offered to all the teachers. Dr. Nymann stated yes, there is certainly no separate cost and how you want it delivered is how you want it. We do it for all teachers, we did one just for aides. Mrs. Conti stated I did ask that because what a benefit to have this kind of training for everyone.

Representative from ESS stated we were asked to present the data which is stellar data but really it is more part of the group deal that they are doing because there is a student that was headed out of district who wasn't coming to school, who ended up coming to ESS, graduated ESS and as a result of also graduating ESS, started her own blog and so we are presenting some data because it is back to the board saying wow look at the positive. When we talk about community, it is not just about money it is about these kids being back in your community and part of your community and really being successful people within that community.

Dr. Francis stated we filled our max capacity of space – would bringing them back be a factor as well. Mrs. Conti stated we are building a program but these folks will actually support more students to fit in the programs that we have here. They will support the students whether

they are in a general ed, a self-contained setting, transitioning back to district and that is the beauty to – it maximizes our students maintaining what we have in the programs here as well.

Mr. Monge stated I want to clarify this. Logically it makes sense. A lot of parents want to keep their kids in the District and obviously the numbers make sense. The issue that I have is when you have a big number sitting on the agenda to vote on without understanding the business plan. Is it in the budget? If it is not in the budget, where is it coming from. Who is selected those 18 kids? What is the plan as it pertains to trying to get those kids into the district? Have some performance based measurements and if you are not hitting your numbers than this is not working. The point is that presentation is not clear and it was brought to Board to vote on but we had a lot of questions that we couldn't answer and this is a big number. Beyond the big number, it is a very important goal that we all agree on how do we bring our kids into district because it is the right thing to do. Yes save money, but it is the right thing to do if we can support. If we can't support them and you don't have the right people here to support, unfortunately we should have kids where they are going to have the support and if we don't have that support base, we need to get it. I agree we need to build on that support base but we have to do it and the presentation I think has to cross the "t's" and dot the "i's" and just throwing the number here with all these questions that we didn't have answered and I still think we have questions that need to get answered as it pertains to it.

Mr. Nufrio stated in all fairness Mr. Monge, this was the time to ask those questions and we have been asking those questions. I suggest this, since we are not voting on this tonight, except for next week possibly right Mr. Tatum, if you have any additional questions you should address them directly to Mrs. Conti and copy Mr. Tatum. We can't keep going around because it gets nowhere. At some point we have to decide; we have to make a decision. Can we please agree that they are prepared to answer any questions that you have as he said he would. It is time now to put it all together. This is the week that will determine where are heads are as a Board and it can't be just one individual objecting. There has to be five votes to pass this and I still stand on the process. I would like to move on and I would like to thank you for coming again this evening. Mrs. Conti be prepared for a lot of emails and certainly Mr. Tatum will make the final recommendation.

Dr. Nymann stated I would like to add that I am glad to answer any questions anybody wants to hand me. Mr. Nufrio stated I would prefer that they address them to Mrs. Conti. Dr. Nymann stated when you talked about the measures, that is the data we provided.

Mr. Monge stated my big question is how are we going to pay for it. You guys did a great job. Mr. Nufrio stated it is a monthly payment, it is not a lump payment. Mr. Brennan can you please respond if you can for now? Is this doable to agree as a Board, to get five votes to entertain this program, do we have the wherewithal to pay for this on a monthly basis. Mr. Brennan stated yes we do. We sat down over the last week, Mrs. Conti, myself and Assistant Business Administrator, Manny Vieira and we went over the special education budget, there is money left in tuition for private schools and there is also breakage within the salaries of the special ed department and Mrs. Conti is also replacing aides that have left the district with part-time aides that don't require benefits. Therefore, we are saving on the benefits side as well. We do have the money. Plus we are doing it pro-rated and we won't be able to start until? Mrs.

Conti stated it depends on the Board so maybe November. Mr. Brennan stated so you are talking  $7/10^{th}$  of \$275,000 – so less than \$210,000. Mrs. Conti stated I'm just concerned about November and just to support the students and make sure that they have a successful start to the school year.

Mr. Tatum stated one final comment on that topic. Dr. Francis brought up an important issue and that is space in the district and that is something else that we have to give consideration to because of the number of programs that we have brought back to the district, we have to be very careful because we do have buildings where our enrollment is high and if you look very carefully where this program is going to be because some of the programs require space so that is one thing that is very important to consider in moving forward.

The other thing is that I want to make it very clear that the plan that Mr. Brennan talked about regarding the financing of the program, the aides and so forth, that is not a special education plan, that is a District plan and that is what we have done budgetarily in the District on a cost savings measure in Personnel and that really is a plan that Mr. Benaquista and I have spoken about that on other occasions so we will look very carefully on how that money is going to be available and for what purposes and we talked about this this afternoon and I just wanted to clarify that for the record. All that money is not earmarked for that particular program.

Mr. Nufrio stated this might be the opportune time to say that I am very pleased to see that Mr. Tatum and his assistants are taking the hands on approach with the Business Office so that we get a much clearer picture as to what we can buy and what to reject. I see this as supplemental health services but again it is my opinion and that of the entire Board that if it is money worth spending or well spent than it is worth it. Again it has to be within the confines of our wallet. Thank you.

Mr. Tatum stated now will go on to the presentations on healthcare benefits. What we were going to talk with Mrs. Paul is InfoSnap and that has to do with the residency initiative that we were talking about and that is going to be tabled until next week.

Mr. Nufrio stated Gallagher will go first and the other two prospects can exit the room.

<u>Presentation by Arthur J. Gallagher Insurance & Co.</u>; presentation appended to the minutes.

Joseph Columbo of Arthur J. Gallagher stated we are public sector brokers and school insurance brokers and this is pretty much what we do. We handle schools in this area, including Springfield, Middlesex County, East Brunswick, Perth Amboy and we will send a list of all of schools. We handle about 30 school districts and employee benefits another 75 on the property casualty in the State of New Jersey.

Arthur J. Gallagher is one of the most ethical brokerage firm in the United States. We take big pride in this and we are going to make sure that everything we do is signed off by and known by the Board, Business Administrator and it is key that we don't make political contributions and it is important to be on the up and up with all that we do. It will be aggravating

to the Business Administrator that he will have to sign off on many different documents. We are audited twice a year, internally to make sure that we have everything in place to keep you out of trouble. Every document in terms of how you are handling your insurance, your employees, we keep documents on file and our own internal audits us to make sure that our clients are doing everything in compliance with the employee benefits.

It is myself, Julianne Kuczynski is on the road every week, we like to have her go out to our schools every other week and if you need more we can do that. She will sit down in your HR office and take calls from your employees. If we have a problem going on, she will sit in different teachers rooms and she is going to make sure that if something comes up we are going to get it corrected quickly with the insurance carriers. In terms of renewals, we work for the Board to keep the cost down. The rest of the year we work with your employees. There used to be a big difference between the Union and the Board but now employees are paying 25-30% of the cost of the insurance and it is in their best interest to keep the costs down and in your best interest.

In some other districts we do a quarterly union meeting and we share with your employees if they wanted to come, what is driving costs up. We have now sat down with the unions and the employees and we explain what is causing it. It is a big change of where it was 5-10 years ago when the employees didn't care.

Employee Advocacy on page 3 – if they have an issue – anything your employees can think of, we write appeals and we help with any kind of problem if they think their benefits aren't being paid properly. They can contact us directly and take your HR out of it. We have a team back at our office to answer questions. A big thing about us is that we don't lose groups. We have not lost a public sector. We have grown by 2-3 school districts a year over the last 15 years. I have taken the best of the best from Blue Cross and Amerihealth – where people came from the carrier side in terms of account management and customer service. Julianne came from Amerihealth, I came from Blue Cross and I was there for 15 years. I ran customer service unit that handled public sector schools and was brought over here and handle that same business. I have handled Springfield Board of Ed for the last 25 years – 10 years at Blue Cross and 15 years here. East Brunswick is another school district we have done for over 30 years.

I would like to tell you about things that we do differently. When I came over, page 4, 14 years ago and I was working for Blue Cross/Blue Shield and if you look at any other industry in any other state, no one has fully insured dental programs. I went through the New Jersey public sector and all these schools have fully insured dental programs. Insurance was meant for controlling risk and I can look at your employees and look back to costs of your dental plans from 5 years ago from 5 years forward, there are no cancer dental plans, there is nothing that drives it out. We lump together school districts and we get the best price on the costs. We went to Delta Dental, Horizon Blue Cross/Blue Shield and we put together a self-insured program. The employees get to keep the same benefits and we are saving 10-20% without doing anything to that. It is a different way of paying for your dental insurance.

Prescriptions – what is driving up costs up is prescriptions. We looked at a lot of schools and how we can get the best in terms lumping it together to keep costs down. We lumped

together and had a fully insured plan of districts of 500-1000 employees and there are 10,000 lives, you can kind of name the costs of what you are going to pay on this insurance. Each district has their own plans and benefits but when you look at it and you get the carrier to agree, we will look at the loss ratio as one, we will not see the big spike. I'm the group setter in there, there are about 12 different school districts so about a 7% increase and you will see that the other districts that are not together, it is probably about 12-13% over time. With a little more volume you get more savings.

The other thing that we do is we do analysis at Gallagher and self-insured on prescription, although it is risky, it is probably what people are going to be looking at in the future. People don't know that when you throw in a prescription, the carriers are receiving rebates so the cost you are paying and they give you what your loss ratios are is about 20% of the premium is kicked back to the carrier when you are fully insured. That is a big number for prescription which is rising drastically. I will do an analysis of all the different prescription companies out and find who is the one we can get the best savings from. We are starting to slowly do this. District's who have a little more room to do some risk we put them into there and again the savings is about 15-20% savings. It is a different way of paying for your prescription but it is something that you start looking at.

When we do that we start taping into how can we control costs. If you fill a prescription at the local grocery store, that same prescription at CVS – there is a big difference in cost and we started educating teachers and employees. Where is the best place to buy, it is the local pharmacy is one of the best places. Costco, your grocery stores are the worst – CVS, Rite Aid and Walgreens higher costs – same prescriptions and if you tell somebody and it helps everything, they start to listen.

Page 7 – speciality medications – look at the costs of these medications, it is ridiculous. If you have one person going on the hepatitis C, \$50,000 for a 3-month supply. There are 125 new medications coming out this year all specialty pharmacy and all will range from \$5,000 a month up to \$25,000 a month.

The next thing to bring up is the exchanges. We try to help employees' children — we put out a website that lets people understand the exchanges, healthcare reform, individual coverage, whether it is your employees child that is aging out and we put a site that links up to yours and it gets the best cost for individuals if you want to roll it out to your student population families, it is a nice thing to have out there. It links people to what is the best possible cost for individual coverage in New Jersey. These are just some of the things that we do over and above.

Employee benefit website – go to a link that puts all your benefits in one spot. We work with your HR department and we will have apps for new hires. When they first walk in what do they need in terms of all the paperwork filled out – it links it back to myself and Julianne to help your employees.

Monitoring – on a monthly basis, we have an underwriter on staff who was the public sector on Blue Cross and Aetna – they are the main carriers here in New Jersey, they are the only ones that do the New Jersey public sector. On a monthly basis we are watching your claims loss

ratio. If we had to renew today, where would your renewal be. We would be able to give you your budget estimates when you want them earlier and earlier and we are giving you what your projections are at that time and all the way up to the renewal date.

We have the most public schools with Aetna which is a big thing because they were out of our market for a while. We have about six schools with Aetna. Now that we have these two big carriers, it helps us with group costs because the giant has about 80% of the schools and now Aetna is coming on strong and we have been able to work back and forth with competition to keep rates down.

ACA reporting – being at Gallagher, some of the best things that we do is we give you the actual support of a big and large brokerage firm. We have 23 attorneys in Philadelphia if there is a question in healthcare reform, it goes right to them and they respond back saying this is how you should fill it out your healthcare reform and this is how you do the documents for the employees. Any question that comes up. You have your Board Attorney but this is just strictly for employee benefits and it will give you a link between what other schools are doing and what other companies are doing. I also have one person on staff that just went to all of our schools and it was a nightmare last year filling out healthcare reform. All that person did was go from school to school for the six months before and help them fill out their forms and link their payroll and they did the coordination efforts and that person is still with us.

Staying with what Gallagher does on a monthly basis – anyone that I load on there you will get what is new and going on for compliance in health insurance. Compliance documents coming from our headquarters, where I'm getting you every document that could possibly affect you - I take those things and if I feel it is specific to New Jersey schools you will see a note from me beside that.

We build those websites and it seems like not one employee goes to it. We also do these hard copies – the district employee benefit guide. If you work for any large employer, you would have your employee benefit book. We try to do books and we said let's come up with an employee handbook that every school district should have and we put all your benefits in one spot. They don't understand how rich their benefits are. People don't understand how much they are receiving from their benefits. One spot shows how much they are receiving from these benefits. It is about a 25-page book that we work with HR and Julianne puts it together so you have one document.

National Survey – it goes out to all of our school districts and every school nationwide. Last year we had 131 public entities respond to this and about 50 were from New Jersey. It is going to survey what other schools are doing. What other areas of the country are doing with their insurance. It is a great tool to get a snapshot of what the new ideas and what is everyone else doing that we should be doing. As you are reading the surveys, what is innovative, what is new in the industry, what is going on in terms of what we should be doing.

What is the new thing going on, you are going to see telemedicine, where you are going to skype with the doctor. It is available and starting to come out. They will still pay a copay. It

could be the middle of the night, 2:00 in the morning, live doctor, my child is sick – it is what is going to be the next phase instead of going to the doctor or the emergency room.

Networks – you have heard of OMNIA from Blue Cross/Blue Shield, they are pushing it. It is the next phase, it is the old HMO. It is great if you live in this area and you go to Summit Medical Group – they are Tier One doctors and you pay a little less in premium.

Wellness programs – some of our districts do this and some don't. We will do a wellness fair, we do weight loss competitions. Julianna stated we do flu shot campaigns and we work establishing the wellness committee and we will work with them. Mr. Columbo stated you can have CVS pharmacist come in and set it up and it is still the same cost and it goes through the insurance but it is a day where you have the nurses on site doing shots. If you don't have a great vision plan, we actually bring in eye doctors and they can do an exam right there and it is \$20 for a pair a glasses and you get your prescription filled. It is another day that the teachers appreciate.

Workforce Evaluation – we plug in all your employees, salaries, benefits – it is just another tool on how you can see who is coming up to retirement, what is important to this population, you have the younger employees and maybe we should be looking at voluntary benefits for these 22-23 year olds who want the lowest costs in plans. Maybe you have an aging population. Once we plug everything in and we get it from you and we run it through our system and there is a whole big report that analyzes your work force and again this is a big district. Where are you at on the table? What should you be concentrating on in terms of what benefits should you offer your employees? As we go along, I think things will be changing where most of the country is going with the high deductible plan and it is going to be how do we introduce that and how do we get employees into that plan.

During the negotiations, right now you have four different plans – you have your open access plan, EPO and high deductible plans and we do all these configuring. During negotiations you kill each over a \$10 co-pay and a \$5 co-pay and it doesn't change the behavior – it doesn't change anything. The cost down here you will see the percentages – you make these big negotiations and you make the change and it is good for one year and then the cost continues to go up. As we start going through this and we start working with the unions and employees, what can we do differently instead of arguing over the co-pay. The doctor tells you to get an MRI, you think nothing about it and go to the hospital. If you went to the local radiologist, that cost is \$344 - if you go to the hospital it is about \$2,000. No one thinks of it with the teacher's insurance because you are just paying the co-pay and you are just going to the closest place but we started getting teachers willing to put up these posters showing MRI here at the hospital and MRI here at the local place – show them the cost, let them see it. Show the cost of your Nasinex at the pharmacy and the Nasinex at CVS. Show that it is a big difference. They are not paying it, it is the District, but it is their money because the cost is going to go up. The little bit of tweaking is going to control costs a little bit. Is it going to fix everything, no but instead of running at a trend of 12% of which it is now, you can run it on 8% and you just start ticking things back and you save here and there.

I urge you to speak to some of our clients, I do have a list. We don't lose clients. We put a real aggressive fee when we put in our bid. We want your business and you will be locked in

for a 3-year period because it is lower than we have across. We have Middlesex County and a lot of other areas. We have Springfield and Morris Union Jointure Commission. You are one of the ones that we would love to have.

Mr. Nufrio stated I just want to indicate for the record and the Board members and public, that the committee that I asked to assemble was comprised of chairs of different committees and they have the opportunity to closely review the proposals and this is still an ongoing process but just be mindful of this for those of you who may not have been at the meeting at the time that we talked, we need to get something done by October 1<sup>st</sup> so in essence there will be a resolution at some point in place for next week after the Board has had an opportunity to at least hear the individuals make their presentation as well as the what the committee has also analyzed in terms of how they viewed the proposals and I believe that Mr. Benaquista and Mr. Brennan were also part of it. At this time, for the sake of time that we are limited in we want to thank you for bringing the presentation and rest assure that the committee has all the information in addition to these handouts and we will caucus at some point and make a decision and you will be notified via the Business Administrator, Mr. Brennan. Mr. Tatum do you have any questions. Mr. Tatum stated no I don't but I want to thank you for coming in and giving a nice presentation.

Mr. Nufrio stated for the record, the objective here is total transparency and I hope that we are at least fulfilling that promise in every possible manner so it may seem repetitive but just like we tell the kids, practice makes perfect so we are going to keep doing this until we get it right.

<u>Presentation by BGIA</u>, presentation appended to the minutes. Mr. Steve Edwards stated let me introduce my colleague Stu Migdon, he is the Director of Employee Benefits and he will make a quick presentation.

By way of background, BGIA is a full service insurance firm and we represent a 100 public entities over the past 25 years including school districts. It is an honor to be here and to be your insurance broker for the past 20 years. Union Board of Ed is more than just a client to me. I love this community. It is my home town. I was born and raised in Union. My mom still lives here. She is a taxpayer in Union Township and neighbor of many of you. I have spent 2-3 days a week here working out of her house. I am a former Board of Education member from the late 80's. Former head of community development and I work closely with officials in Vauxhall and other leaders throughout the community; a variety of real estate projects and I'm very proud of this community and I think many of you can attest that I invested my heart and soul into this community.

That is why when BGIA decided to deploy a wellness coach, all of our clients we had around the State, we chose Union Board of Education as the model district. Union Board of Ed was the first district in the State of New Jersey to deploy a wellness coach and you are going to hear from Stu about some very powerful results and the important thing is that your taxpayers and the Board, is on the right path. If you look at what corporate America is doing to contain healthcare costs that are spiraling out of control for many years, the only thing that you can do, you can hire the best insurance brokers in the world that will do a great job at renewal time, that

will help you with negotiations, but you must attack the claim cost. That is 85 cents of every dollar of every premium that you pay, you need to attack that and that is what corporate America is doing and that is what we help you to do about seven years ago. If you can reduce the incident of claims, you can start to contain your healthcare costs.

We are going to talk about what kind of impact those efforts made on your medical loss ratio and as a result on your premiums. You were a model district, the first district in the State and I love this community and another example is as the president of New Jersey Hall of Fame Foundation Board, when I had to decide what was the first school that the mobile museum was going to roll into, it rolled into my grammar school at Livingston School – right up the street from my mom's house. Other than the birth of my daughters, it was one of the best days of my life. In part since I was not a great student, so it was good to bring some inspiration back to other students and it was a wonderful day and it is something that I am proud of.

The point is this as it relates to taxpayers. When you have a problem, when it is time for renewal, when it is time for negotiations, we got your back. You are much more than just another client, with no disrespect to the other insurance brokers, you are going to hear from professionals and I have no doubt and they will have great track records – this is personal. I recognize a lot of people in this room, I went to school with a lot of these people in this room. My reputation is on the line when it comes to your second largest healthcare expense.

What have we done for the taxpayers, that is what we are here to talk about. I want to introduce my colleague, Stu Migdon and then I will jump back in during the wellness piece of the presentation.

Stu Migdon stated thank you for the opportunity to present to you folks a quick little something about me. I have been in the insurance business for 29 years, managing healthcare premiums. I started my career in accounting and I became a Certified Public Accountant and worked in public accounting for five years before I came into the health insurance field and why I tell you that is because numbers is critically important as it relates to managing your healthcare costs and I understand the numbers and I'm associated with the program and each program. In fact, Horizon Blue Cross Blue Shield of New Jersey is your healthcare provider and they had a forum about two weeks ago and they invited 5 people on a panel and 250 people from Horizon Blue Cross/Blue Shield in the audience and the 5 people on the panel were there to critique Horizon and give Horizon ideas on how they can improve the future. There were only two brokers on that panel, myself and somebody from Mercer and the reason why they chose me was because I am highly critical of Horizon when it comes to their underwriting efforts and making sure that I keep their underwriting folks feet to the fire. Although I butt heads with Horizon quite often, they were looking for critiques so they invited me in and every time they asked a question, they said o.k. everybody be ready for it and I gave it to them as it relates to some of the issues that they have going on in their company.

With that, I will say there are a few basic categories that your insurance broker needs to be involved. No. 1 – we are responsible for managing insurance premiums, trying to keep them as low as possible. No. 2 – we are here to help reduce your claim cost as best as we possibly can and No. 3 we are here to deliver to you the best state of the art health insurance plans designs

that we possibly can and understanding that you have Union contracts and Union negotiations that go on so in that realm we need to be aggressive in that regard and then we have to come to you with the proper service and all of the categories that you folks need a good broker. So for 23 years, I have been involved here at the Board of Education doing these things. I wanted to show you is for the last 10 years and we said how much money did we save the Board of Education taxpayers relative to the insurance premium aspect of what a broker does and when we went ahead and accumulated that we saw over \$11 million was saved specifically related to the services that BGIA performs on your behalf and here is a year by year analysis of those savings and what I would like to do to give you an idea of how we go about doing that so we can show you some real tangible results, I'm just going to tackle the \$2 million number so I'm not going to give you guys big packages but I'm going to hand you out pieces of paper and look over here and it will give you a good summary on how we are able to save this \$11 million for the taxpayers here at the Union Board of Education.

I want you to see that Horizon this year delivered to you through me an increase that is highlighted here of 19.5% and your premium was \$23 million and when we were done with our negotiations, you will see that your renewal came in at 9% - \$21 million in premium and \$2 million of savings. These are Horizon documents delivered to me. I want you to see an email exchange of what goes on. Joe Albano is one of the managers at Horizon and he sent me an email on December 3<sup>rd</sup> and it says that Joe C will be getting back to you today with our best and final position on the renewal because I was pushing him and saying I need this renewal, where are you guys at? Friday, December 4th, you will see I got an email from Joe C's account manager Michelle Witherspoon and it said a decision was made to revise the renewal increase to 14% on your healthcare. About 45 minutes later I sent an email to Joe and I said Michelle went ahead and told me that is your final and best offer so listen, be prepared because I'm going to the Union Board of Education and tell them unacceptable and that we need to do something different. I said to him thanks for giving this to me and I understand it is your best and final offer, there is nothing more than you can do, you came down a million, I need you to come another million dollars. I called Joe as well and he said Stu there is nothing we can do. I said I am going to do everything in my power and I made phone calls that weekend to people I know in this business to get you a better rate. Monday, December 7<sup>th</sup> I get an email – per our conversation Stuart, we agree to reduce the rate to a 9% increase for healthcare. It went from 19 to 14 to 9 and that is the kind of the things that we do every single year on your behalf. There is so much to say behind the scenes in that regard.

Not only do we manage your healthcare costs specific to reducing them from Horizon but we are very aware of what your costs are related to the State Health Benefits Plan. We look at that every year and you can go back to the State Health Benefits Plan anytime you like but when I look at your numbers actuarially like a CPA would and I ask Horizon to let me see this and let me see that and then Horizon says we can do 14% and I say if you do this and this and this you can get to 9% and another carrier is going to get me to 9% but then I have to compare it to the State Health Benefits Plan. If you look at the highlights here you will see how much below the State Health Benefits Plan you have been since we recommended that you leave the State Health Benefits Plan on March 1, 2011. Not only do we want to make sure that you are competitive from an industry perspective for your health insurance outside of the State, we want to make sure you are competitive with the State Health Benefits Plan and we show you a \$4.3 million savings

since you left the State Health Benefits Plan. Every year it is our responsibility to make sure that continues.

I also mentioned on the top of my presentation to you that you can make changes based on your plan design but you have Union negotiations to deal with as well. You will see that we have been involved in Union negotiations here for 23 years and I can remember when I was here to 12:30 in the morning and rolling up our sleeves and figuring out what we could best do. I believe that your NGEA and Unions have cooperated with good information that we provided and we have come to great agreements together. They have a very strong relationship with us as a broker and you will see just by this page here, we have been able to make recommendations where people that are hired after 8/1/15 have choices for plans that are limited from those plans that are more expenses based on good negotiations that we have been involved with. I know Vito that you were on the Negotiations Committee and we have spent much time together in the last go around in regards to this.

In addition, we recommended that you take a position with the OMNIA plans that were brand new in January this year and we said introduce them and let people try them and you had six of your people chose them and they are 20% or more lower than your cost. Your employees chose them and they are becoming comfortable with them and I believe more and more of your employees will go with the OMNIA plan.

Not only do we manage your costs from a premium perspective compared to the State Health Benefits Plan but we also get involved in your plan design as well.

I would like to show you what Steve touched upon as well and here the other place we can manage your cost is in your claim costs. What is being done to reduce your claims. You folks are credible. You have enough employees so that all of your experience plays into what your renewal will look like. If we can somehow change your claims then we could potentially change your renewals.

We introduced Wellness Coaches USA to the State of New Jersey. They did not have one public entity in the State of New Jersey when we introduced them and where did we introduce them first, to the Union Township Board of Education and you have a wellness coach, boots on the ground here, that reports back to us on a monthly basis with results on how they are able to make your employees healthier, more productive and as a result of that save the Township of Union Board of Education money. I want you to see that since we have deployed a wellness coach here, they have engaged with over 330 of your employees. In addition to that, 31 of your employees have quit smoking. That is significant because we don't know exactly what that will result in a savings to you. We go by industry standards that say \$1600 a year is saved by someone who doesn't smoke to someone who does but that smoker could ultimately have a stroke or heart attack and cost you \$300-500,000. In addition we engage over 85 employees to increase exercise; 87 people lost a total of 1,000 pounds and this is the one that I am most proud of, 391 employees reduced their blood pressure. High blood pressure is the number one cause of heart attack and stroke and so we have a wellness coach that walks around with a blood pressure machine, scale and work with you to help you live a healthier life and reduce your claim costs.

Mr. Edwards stated we also helped Mrs. Damato to create the first wellness committee and these are the types of things that when you have a committee and you have employees that are passionate about wellness it starts to spread, you start to change the culture and that is very important to do in any organization. You are one of the few districts in Union County that I know of that has done so much in the area of wellness.

Mr. Migdon stated if you look at the industry standard indices on these different items that were changed as a result of the wellness coach it interpreted to almost \$1 million in savings. In addition to the \$11 million – by keeping your employees healthier. We can't really quantify exactly but it means much more than that – who knows what it means in terms of a classroom and teaching children.

Mr. Edwards stated we use the Institute of Health as a resource and I'm trying to quantify the savings, we don't reach for numbers, we base them off what other organizations in the industry uses.

Mr. Migdon stated I mentioned at the top of my presentation that a good health insurance broker will look at your health insurance premiums and costs and manage them and they will also look at your claims and help you manage them as well and they will also look at your negotiations relative to your plan design and manage them. There are a whole bunch of other services that we provide and I am comfortable to say in front of some folks here that I have worked with, your Superintendent and Gerry and others that we have been here for 23 years and I don't think we have had one complaint and we have much accolades given to us by many of your employees.

As Steve said this is a client that is personal to us, it is our first public sector client that we had, I am not from Union but I was here 23 years ago when we first started and I look forward to being here and servicing Union for many years to come.

Mr. Nufrio stated we are going to withhold questions because I formulated a committee specifically designed to review the proposals, but I wanted the entire Board to see what exactly you guys were about and what the other possible brokers would be about. With that, we are still not going to make a decision until next Tuesday and at that time we hope to align that decision based on your presentation, the committee's input and it is still a Board decision and not a committee decision and certainly all three candidates will be reviewed in the same manner. Fairly and equitably in terms of what your proposal contains and it is also about the dollars that are involved. We are going to refrain from any questions because it will simply be repetitive.

Mr. Edwards stated this is your second largest expense behind salaries. You are going about this in the right way. It is a judicious way and a fair way. I will simply say that you are on a good path as it relates to attacking those claim costs and specific to that point if you look at the loss ratio for the past seven years since we put the employee wellness coach in. Your medical loss ratio has gone day in six of the seven years that they have been in place. Lower medical loss ratio means more favorable renewals from the carrier market place. I think that is a very important point. He told a story about his dad and becoming a brain surgeon. He states that I bring this up because my dad went into it for all the right reason, he wanted respect, he wanted to

heal people and it pained him to see the medical industry so out of control, healthcare costs going out of control, insurance executive making big parachutes and I asked him one day, dad what do you want from me and this is about 10 years ago, what is the problem, how do you solve this healthcare crisis in this country and he said you stop people from having heart attacks and strokes that they don't deserve and they don't need to get. 80% of healthcare spending is consumed by 20% of the people of the country because of obesity, high blood pressure and things like that and that was his point and that was the beginning of the seeds of my head that I really want to do more. We just want to do slick renewals – it is not slick we save money but we wanted to go a step further and we wanted to do what GE and Johnson and Johnson was doing and that is what we put in place. You are on the right path in whatever you do. You should stay on that path because it is the only way and chance you have to contain the healthcare costs for the taxpayer. You can hire the best brokers in the world but that claim information is what it is and if it is high, you are getting a big renewal. You are not doing anything to reduce the incidences, the claim cost is going to go up.

Mr. Migdon stated cost is the factor, we applied originally to a request for qualification where our costs were indicated and we just responded recently there and I will say that our commission that we receive as part of your raise is more than 50% less than what Horizon calls the standard commissions. Horizon on the size of group that you have here, produces a public record where the commissions would be 2.25% of your premium and that is their standards and we are at 1.11%.

Mr. Nufrio stated thank you. The third group also submitted a proposal which was reviewed by the committee. The committee has not rendered an opinion because I, Mr. Tatum and our Board Attorney felt that the Board needs to hear everything and certainly we are not a legislative committee, we are simply a committee that would guide us towards the right decision.

<u>Presentation by Willis Towers Watson</u>, presentation appended to minutes. John Moore stated I am the northeast public sector practice leader. I am not going to spend a lot of time talking about who we are or who I am. I have 38 years. Chuck Walter has 25 years on the brokerage side and Denise Lang has 5 years on the underwriting side and 15 years on the brokerage side and her background is that she worked for Horizon in customer service.

Tonight our goal is to get you comfortable with as much as you can in a very short period of time and get you comfortable on who we are and our expertise and hopefully we can convey some strategies that make sense for the district.

As part of the northeast of New Jersey, we handle over 100 public schools, municipalities and counties for risk management and health benefit consultants. We are not cutting our teeth on anything we are chatting about. We would like to talk about some of the strategies, steps of the project that we will talk to you about. We are broken up into four business segments.

Chuck Walter stated what are our resources and what do we bring to the table. We are broken up to really well qualified silos. Reporting analytics and analysis is really what the broker traditionally always done. The negotiating the renewal, the marketing of the plan, doing underwriting work, looking at claims data and really trying to find out how best to run your

program. This is what Denise and I and our team do on a day-to-day basis. The additional resources that we bring to the table where we have subject matter experts that are part of our team.

Healthy outcomes is our wellness division and we will go through what they do. Communications and media is very important area for us because we try to make sure that everyone understands their plan but everyone learns differently. If you are in a meeting and listening to someone talk about insurance, you may understand it at that time but when you go use your plan you don't understand it and how it works. We put a lot of resources into our communication and media and I have some ideas of what we will do there.

NLRG is our legal research group – these are the people that keep us apprised and upated on the various rules and regulations that have come down from a State level, federal level or even local levels where there are leave laws being passed. Our HR Partner is the HR side where we can help with resources on the HR side with some tools and additional stuff that we have.

I am going to focus on reporting analytics and analysis and communications. Based on some of the information we do know, those are three areas that immediately impact the Board of Education.

This is our team, the left side of the chart are the people that you will deal with on a day-to-day basis. Myself, Denise, Sam Stasik is a day-to-day consultant and he does a lot of work in the office but does come out at times, Justin O'Connor is our team leader and he is a resource and Andrea Brodde is our financial person. We have a financial underwriter that also is part of our team because he does a lot of the claim reporting for us, forecasting of renewals and data analysis.

The right side is all our subject matter experts. Jay Kirschbaum is our legal person, Dan Margolis is our human resources person, Lynda Colatrella is our wellness consultant and Marion Lunt is our communication specialist.

Based on the information that we do know, I wanted to put together steps to this project and based on what we know and how we think we would attack it if we were fortunate enough to earn the business. The first thing to do is get detailed information on how the plan is, what is the network penetration, what are being utilized. Utilization is a huge issue right now with the trend. Prices are going up on average 14-15% per year; how can we try to impact that. Detailed large claims — what is impacting your overall experience. Your budget for benefits is over \$20 million a year so how can we use our expertise and tools and resources to try to keep that down as much as possible.

As I put on the bottom of this is 1% of savings is \$200,000 which is a lot of money to a district when you look at what teacher salaries are and how you can make sure you are fulfilling and providing all the resources to your students.

Assess the plan of performance – how are the claims running and use that to underwrite and estimate your March 1, 2017 renewal. The fact is that you are at \$20 million in premium

and we know if we look at your claims data – we know Horizon's underwriting formula. We should be able to tell you based on how Horizon underwrites, based on your claims data, this is where this renewal should come out; based on what they need to run their business and provide you benefits and once we know that, set expectations with Horizon and Delta Dental on where we expect the renewal to come in. The fact of the matter is, Horizon is likely to come out with a renewal that is super high and then it is a negotiation game. If you were 100 employees, that might be something that there is a lot more leeway but at \$20 million premium it shouldn't be that way, we should be able to tell you at any rolling 12-month period you could call us up and ask us where do you think our renewal is coming in at. We should be able to tell you based on 12 months experience where it will be coming in. There shouldn't be any mystery about it.

Setting expectations with Horizon is important. We should also have Direct Access at this size. Whoever is working on this account should be face-to-face with us and you in a meeting and discussing where this is going.

Perform a thorough marketing analysis for both medical and dental – a lot of times this could be just a bid check because we know you have been with Horizon for a long period of time and if there is savings on the table then we have to go through the whole equal to or better than and making sure on the collective bargaining agreement that everything is copious and o.k. from that perspective and how does the network match up.

Benchmark programs against the State Employer Plan to see how the State stacks up, how do the benefits stack up to what you are offered right now and again some additional analysis that we do. Discount analysis – is Horizon getting the best discounts in this area or is Cigna or Aetna better. How your demographics stack up on a benchmark basis.

Contribution analysis – you guys offer probably 5-6 plans and we know Chapter 78, they pay what they pay. The fact is do your employees know that the difference between Plan 1, 2 and 3 – how much it saves them on a paycheck basis and what really are the differences in the benefits. Everybody pretty much goes to the Plan 20 and that is great but maybe the Plan 15 is better for them and it is saving them money but at the same time it is also saving the district money. We need to do that analysis and communicate to the membership to make sure that they are making an educated decision because at the end of the day, the district wants to save money and the employees should also want to save money too because it is coming out of their pay. Again 1% savings - \$200,000 and that is a lot of money.

Communications media – this goes hand in hand – how do we make sure people understand what they have. We always look at it and say what is the best media form to use and I don't think it is a one size fits all. Can you get people to come to meetings or have meeting and hope people show up and is it a way to really get in front of people is webinar or Flipbooks – do we have email addresses so we can send them a Flipbook that really walks through all of their benefits or a Brainshark that walks through and explains how the benefits work and is it paper, some people would probably still want paper or something physical to read.

Create a new hire and enrollment guide if you don't have one to make sure that everybody understands what the benefits are, what is offered to them and how the programs work and who their contact information is.

Portal patient care – I will have Denise talk about that. If interested we can do an employee survey on communications – we can send a SurveyMonkey on how people would want to be communicated to about this information.

Create a monthly calendar of communications to keep members up to speed. Horizon is always coming out with new things. Are we making sure the employees understand what those new things are and how to use them and communicate the Horizon resources that are available in education.

Denise Lang stated most people find it intimating and complicated and with a large amount of choices to make – you want to make sure you understand them and you are utilizing your benefits to the best suits your family's needs.

What we have with patient care is that they are our employee advocacy service and what they do is assist your employees with making decisions in regard to what plan is best for them and their families. Not only is a good open enrollment resource and talk about the different plans, but throughout the year if they have issues with claims or billing questions or if they need help with their providers, they are there to assist them. They will make appointments for your employees, it is also available to the parent and parent-in-laws and employees to utilize as well. They are available Monday through Friday from 8 a.m. to 9 p.m. and on Saturdays form 9 a.m. to 2 p.m. What that speaks to is you don't have your employees on the phone during the day with Horizon trying to work out their claim issues, they have advocates with patient care who will do that for them. They can call them on the 800 number that we provide or they can email them their issues and they will get back to them with a resolution. The other thing that this provides is that it limits the exposure of HR to HPPA sensitive information. You really don't want to be involved with your employees information so that takes that away from HR and allows patient care to assist them and help them with making better choices for themselves and using the benefits that you provide for them.

Mr. Walter stated you will get a report, so the administration will see that and it gives the activity for the specific month and so you can see what your people are using. If we don't see a lot of activity then we know we need to communicate resources there. It is very valuable.

Ms. Lang stated Chuck already talked about the communication that we can provide to the employees and how people actually do learn and some are more visual. With our millennials they like smart phones and computer access. Some people prefer the hard copy option. So with the Flipbook it is something that we would send out via email and it would show them what their benefits are and we can also do a print hard copy of a basic guide and one good thing about the basic guide is not only can we put the actual benefits in there but you are responsible for providing notices to your employees, Medicare Part D, COBRA, etc. and we are able to provide that information within the benefit guide to eliminate you having to send this information out separately.

We also have the Brainshark which is similar to the Flipbook but the Brainshark has a voiceover so you actually have someone talking to the employees about the different benefits and they can actually maneuver through it and if they weren't sure about something more specific — you can click on it and review it again. We can also do video postcards, a link that we send out in a blast if you have open enrollment or something that you want to discuss with your employees. We also have a mobile wallet card — what it does it takes all the benefit information for your employees and it will display on the wallet card for easy access instead of fumbling for a different ID card, trying to figure out what the phone number is, it is all provided right here in the wallet card.

Mr. Walter stated the third topic is wellness. I know that you guys are big on wellness and really trying to expand it and keep it proven the way it is. We want to do a deeper dive into the wellness program – what is working, does it integrate with the carrier, is it integrating with Horizon Blue Cross/Blue Shield and how are outcomes measured.

Everybody's definition of wellness is completely different. We go into companies and they say we have a wellness program and it could be a weight loss program and other companies have wellness which you have mandatory biometric screenings, you have to get a preventive care benefit exam and we base that on contributions which you guys cannot do. We do have a wellness resource and she would work with us and your team to develop what you guys want in what your wellness program could be like moving forward.

We have to look at the budget and goals. Horizon has a lot of very good resources on the wellness side and I don't know how well they are being utilized or not. They do have biometric screenings and education sessions that follow along with them. They have the flu shot clinics, they have the be fit program which is a gym reimbursement program. They have nurse lines and maternity health coaches, they have an employee assistance program, they do have a telephonic coaching program and they have a rewards program too if you do certain things.

Horizon has done a very good job at developing these programs. Our big thing about wellness is if you are going to do wellness programs, you want to make sure it is somehow integrated with the carrier because the carrier is looking for that data. We are not getting into specific data but if they see an employee is pre-hypertensive, they will have a nurse outreach and say, do you know about these resources or have you gone to the doctor to see if you need to go onto some sort of medication before that person becomes a large claim. We want to make sure that everything is integrated.

We want to check to see if we can get Horizon to build in a wellness budget for us as part of the program. Some carriers are willing to do that. Based on what I heard, I think you need an outside vendor if you are looking for somebody who is onsite, who is taking blood pressure or nutrition counseling or things like. We do not have a wellness consultant or nutritionist on staff who is going to do that. It will be an outside vendor that we would work with you guys to develop that program if you want that to be. This is all about education on the wellness side.

HR partner is our human resources — this is more for your human resource person. If they have questions or if you need to do training, we have those online and NRLG is our legal research group and that will keep us up to speed on changes in the laws of the State and country.

We have the resources, we are a mid-market, this is what we do day-to-day. A team approach and we are looking to do this for both medical and dental.

Mr. Nufrio stated thank you. As I indicated to the Board and the public that the committee has been reviewing the proposals and you were the last to make a presentation. To be fair and just to all the prospects, I wanted the Board to be able to hear you. Thank you for being here and spending all the time that you did and the analysis that you brought to the committee. The committee as I indicated earlier was comprised of the Board chairs of the different areas and that was Mr. Arminio from Personnel, Mr. McDowell from Education, Mr. Monge from the money department and Mrs. Zuena from Operations. It is an exhausting process but we hope to arrive at a consensus by Tuesday and we will notify you either way. Thank you for coming this evening and your presentation will assist everyone in understanding what is going on.

Just remember when considering who the winner of these contestants is going to be, consider of course all aspects of the services that they render, how this District will benefit and of course there are many other aspects that go into selecting a broker which ultimately will help us through the forthcoming negotiations with our different units. We are bound by simple logic to have a broker. We are not bound by the State. It certainly would not be prudent to either proceed without a broker and this was researched thoroughly and I was surprised to learn that I was actually correct that the State does not mandate a broker but it would be unwise not to have one.

It is an annual renewal which will result in the selection. The fee on this particular firm was clearly stated and it was not inclusive of a wellness coach which we would have to contract out. I don't know Mr. Griggs if it is permitted to discuss all other fees. Mr. Griggs stated I would not.

Mr. Nufrio stated we will not be having Principal Lowery here as was scheduled – that is going to be tabled for now. Mrs. Paul has been tabled also.

## EDUCATION/STUDENT DISCIPLINE COMMITTEE RESOLUTIONS:

Mr. McDowell presented the Education/Student Discipline Committee agenda.

Moved by Mr. McDowell, seconded by Mr. Monge, that the following resolution be approved:

# E-3. APPROVE 2014 NEW JERSEY CORE CURRICULUM CONTENT STANDARDS – TECHNOLOGY

Approve to update/replace the existing elementary computer curriculum with the 2014 New Jersey Core Curriculum Content Standards - Technology, in accordance with the information appended to the minutes.

## **DISCUSSION ON E-3:**

None

AYE: Mr. Arminio, Dr. Francis, Mr. Le, Mr. McDowell, Mr. Monge, Mrs. Regis-Darby, Mr. Salcedo, Mrs. Zuena, Mr. Nufrio

NAY: None

ABSTAIN: None

**MOTION CARRIED** 

## DISCUSSION:

Mr. Monge stated E-2 – as part of the back-up should be N.J.A.C. 6A. Mr. Nufrio asked in whose department does that fall under? Mr. Monge stated it is a contract would it fall under Fiscal. Mr. Nufrio stated the question is what services does New Road provide? Mrs. Conti stated it falls under educational. Mr. Nufrio stated so this is the collateral aspect of that particular school.

## FISCAL AND PLANNING COMMITTEE RESOLUTIONS:

Mr. Monge presented the Fiscal and Planning Committee agenda.

## DISCUSSION:

Mr. Monge stated \$81,000 disbursement for Jefferson. Mr. Brennan stated that was the closeout.

Mr. Monge stated F-4 it seems like the boiler project is inappropriately labeled as roof bid. I will point it out to you at another time. Mr. Brennan stated o.k.

Mr. Monge stated F-5 and F-8, am I to assume that anything hardware and software purchases and the like were going to go through the Director of Technology and if that is the case then F-5 if she is part of that approval process. Mr. Benaquista stated that anytime a technology requisition is created, in order for it to get processed, there is a signature for the Director — Ann Hart use to sign off when she was in charge of technology, now Mrs. Paul has to sign off before that requisition gets created to a purchase order. Mr. Monge stated so we should just make an assumption versus it being part of her being noted as a sign off on that.

Mr. Nufrio stated what I suggested last time to help clear the path for something new is to have a separate resolution just strictly for technology in which that can be embedded. At least we can isolate all that which pertains to technology will have its own resolutions. Can we proceed with that Mr. Brennan? Mr. Brennan stated sure. Mr. Nufrio stated if we have to we can remove this and establish the technology resolution.

Mr. Monge stated there is one about the copiers. Mr. Nufrio stated I am not going to determine what goes where, I will let Mr. Tatum and Mr. Brennan make that determination. Mr. Monge stated I agree.

F-7 – under dates, it says various versus a specific date. Did we normally approve trips that are various dates? Mr. Brennan stated that is transportation. These are class trips. Mr.

Benaquista stated the community based instructions – Stop & Shop. They have different times. Mr. Monge stated if that is acceptable that is fine. Mr. Nufrio stated it is one of the anomalies that could be acceptable because it is year-to-year staff.

Mr. Monge stated last thing, F-4 – under IDEA appropriation and maybe I'm reading this wrong Mr. Brennan – my comment was it seems like it was never budgeted. I see the original budgeted amount was \$0 but now I see the appropriation dollar amount. Is this a new budget item and we are shifting money to fund? Mr. Brennan stated I will have to look into that. Mr. Monge stated that is fine, you can get back to me.

This is our final tally for last week for the total. Mr. Brennan stated yes, as of June 30<sup>th</sup>. There was a change in cash, not in the bottom line amount, just a journal entry. Mr. Vieira wanted to submit the report.

Mr. Monge stated where I we will budget versus actual bottom line? I thought I read \$5 million but maybe I'm misreading that. Mr. Brennan stated I will have to get back to you and talk.

Mr. Nufrio stated Mr. Monge and Mr. Brennan did not have a chance to meet because of personal reasons Mr. Monge was not available so that is why all these questions because normally we would have done this already.

Moved by Mr. Monge, seconded by Mr. Le, that the following resolution be approved.

## F-12. ACCEPT DONATION FROM COSTCO

Accept the donation of 350 backpacks and supplies from Costco, 1055 Hudson Street, Union, New Jersey, for use by students' districtwide.

## DISCUSSION:

Mrs. Zuena asked who are these backpacks going to? How do they select who gets them? Mr. Loessel stated Jefferson was the one to go get them. Mrs. Watson stated we received a phone call from Cosco stating a local school district did not come to pick up the backpacks and they called us and asked if we wanted them. In 2000 Hannah Caldwell received a donation that was distributed districtwide so we figured it was no problem doing that. They are not going to our students alone, we have figured elementary or any children that need them will be distributed on an as need basis because our kids already have come with their supplies.

Mrs. Zuena stated that is great as long as they are distributed because in one of my trips with Tom around the District we found a couple of hundred of backpacks at the warehouse that have never been distributed that are filled with supplies that are taking up a large portion of our warehouse. Mr. Tatum stated what Nancy is referring to is something that became very controversial years ago because those backpacks would have been distributed but then there was a question of the origins of where they came from and therefore we were told not to distribute. But with Costco it is not affiliated. Mrs. Zuena stated can we take the supplies out and give them out. Mr. Monge stated we can donate those backpacks. Mrs. Zuena stated they are taking up a huge room. Mr. Tatum stated unfortunately they got stockpiled and we got onto other things.

We certainly with the Board's permission we can do something like that and donate them. Mrs. Zuena stated Barry and I talked about it earlier. Dr. Francis asked is there a logo on those backpacks? Mr. Tatum stated if I recall correctly yes. Mr. Nufrio stated I'm sure this is not going to be a monumental project. Let's figure it and do it for the kids and distribute them to those who need them. Mr. Tatum we look to you to direct the individuals that will be responsible to do that.

AYE: Mr. Arminio, Dr. Francis, Mr. Le, Mr. McDowell, Mr. Monge, Mrs. Regis-Darby, Mr. Salcedo, Mrs. Zuena, Mr. Nufrio

NAY: None

ABSTAIN: None MOTION CARRIED

## **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE RESOLUTIONS:**

Mrs. Zuena presented the Operations Committee agenda.

## DISCUSSION:

Mr. McDowell stated O-3, it has dimensions down here, it should be feet not inches.

Mr. Monge stated O-4, I know we had a conversation and we tabled it because we are trying to figure out reporting mechanisms — what has happened historically and what are we expecting them to do reporting wise to make sure that we can measure their effectiveness. Mr. Tatum stated we were looking for some statistics on the actual program. Mr. Monge stated I saw that but the question is how does that get incorporated into the agreement maybe. It is performance measures. We have a historical but what are we asking them to be done. Mrs. Moses stated I have some information on that and I can pass it out.

You have the end of the year summary report and you also should have the programs data that was given to Mrs. Conti and she passed it on to us from the high school. The end of the year report it tells you all the programs that were put in place for 2015-2016 which was last school year. They have the individual counseling, the team counseling, the staff consultation, the parent training and community resources. They have the crisis management, intervention and so forth.

If you look at support programing, you see the results there. What is the student support program? It is a program that will support the children with their conduct, academic behavior, family issues and so forth. The 63% of the students that they service, which is a large amount of students that they give a lot of support to, and they do service a lot of kids for that issue there and they also if you see below that, any children with anxiety too. The children that don't want to go to school because of certain situations – it could be many things. They keep data on the 63%.

Underneath that you still have 83% of the students that obtain this service that have problems with depression so one might think that the children with depression and the children that went all the way to the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter – is very much connected to their conduct and their academics so they have these issues in response to the behaviors. The 83% is really a major part of why are children have that conduct behavior. They have serviced a lot of the children in the high school – maybe 50 but 83% of them came back again for these services. One might say is it

really needed? Yes because they really like the services and I think that is what Mr. Lowery was saying when I went to speak with him. The kids really do go to those services when they need them.

Mr. Benaquista stated I can't give you the data but I was at the high school for a long period of time. I was there before this program and during the program. I can tell you there was a demand for the services and students that needed the service and needed the help, sought it out on an almost regular basis to make it through their days and they relied on these individuals and programs. If some reason someone wasn't available and they weren't there that day, you almost had to work with that individual as an administrator on a different basis because they didn't have the support they needed. It did help administration when dealing with crisis situations where some of the issues that these students have, they would not have made it through the day and then they wouldn't be in school if they didn't have this available to them.

Mr. Monge stated this report is part of the agreement is required at the end. Mrs. Moses stated yes. Mr. Monge stated this is great information – thank you.

Mr. Nufrio stated it is just to justify the expenditure and from what I just heard from Mr. Benaquista and Mrs. Moses, my personal opinion it is productive, it does have results and those are the questions that we asked Mrs. Moses to produce for us and thank you for getting this and thank you to Mrs. Conti also. At this point we go back to the resolution and we will consider it next week for the renewal of this program. Our kids need these services. Without these services we are going to be depending on administrators, guidance, our school psychologist and there is no way you can actually have such great expectations from a staff that is somewhat skeletal. Look at the number these people handle. Who else would handle them? No disrespect intended, but they need special handling and when it comes to mental health it is a wide open arena. Every dollar spent to help a child is a dollar well spent. Mr. Arminio stated they wouldn't have the time to deal with these individuals along with all the other job requirements.

Mr. Tatum stated I have gotten feedback from parents about the service to their children and more importantly many of the students who are involved in I&RS, special services have come back and really felt like this was very important to them in high school and the program has been in existence from Jefferson school up to the high school now and that is where it has landed.

Mr. Nufrio stated if you can reach one child, you did a good job that day and that translates into many other aspects. The classroom teacher reaches one child and hopefully more than one and with that success story comes others and with mental health it is a very complicated area for anyone other than the specialist to address.

Mrs. Zuena stated there is two discussion items. One is request of Vauxhall Historical Society requesting permission to use Jefferson Elementary School gym for the Veterans' Day Program – November 5, 2016 from 10 a.m. to 2 p.m. and request the waiver of fees. Mr. Nufrio stated this is something that we do annually. Mrs. Zuena stated yes and I thought they provided a Certificate of Insurance when we waive the fees.

Mr. Nufrio stated Mr. Brennan would be the one to look into that and hopefully that is so and if there are no objections. Mr. Tatum stated they didn't provide certificate but we still gave it to them. Mr. Monge stated you can't do that.

Mr. Griggs stated I think you need to see what you can do to encourage them to try to find insurance or check with their own carrier or to see if there is some other way to doing it. Just to protect the Board from any liability. You need something. Mr. Brennan stated we'll contact Fairview. Mr. Griggs stated there are small daily things you can get for one event. Talk to your broker and maybe they can do something. Mr. Nufrio stated that is a good suggestion Mr. Griggs and if we can find a path to satisfy this then certainly it shouldn't be an objection afterwards.

Mrs. Zuena stated the second is a request from the League of Women Voters of Union to use Union High School Library for a televised Candidates Debate on Monday, October 24, 2016 from 7 p.m. to 10 p.m. (pending receipt of Certificate of Insurance). Mr. Nufrio stated and that is the same thing which is done annually and it is part of the process. The key element here is televised. I don't think this year will be a problem because there are six candidates and if one chooses not to attend it will not dismiss the televising of that. Mr. Arminio stated and that is a different discussion. Our discussion now is only to use not anything else other than that.

Mrs. Cappiello asked will those items go on as a resolution for next week. Mr. Nufrio stated yes, as long as the criteria has been met.

Mr. Griggs stated maybe the PTA can get involved because they have insurance and maybe the PTA can request it on behalf of this organization to use your facilities. Mr. Nufrio stated assuming the PTA has insurance, it shouldn't be a problem.

#### PERSONNEL COMMITTEE RESOLUTIONS:

Mr. Arminio presented the Personnel Committee agenda that were not be voted on at worksession.

#### DISCUSSION:

None

Moved by Mr. Arminio, seconded by Mrs. Regis-Darby, that the following resolutions be adopted:

#### P-1. APPROVE PERSONNEL ACTIONS

That personnel actions be approved in accordance with the information appended to the minutes.

## P-2. APPROVE AMENDED SUBSTITUTE LIST FOR 2016-2017

That the Board amend Substitute Lists for the 2016-2017 school year in accordance with the information in the hands of each Board.

# P-3. ACCEPT LETTERS OF RESIGNATION That the Board accept letters of resignation/retirement from the following staff:

Name	Position	Location	Effective Date	Reason	Notes/ Corrections
Jenkins,	Instructional	Franklin	9/1/2016	Resignation	
Jermel	Paraprofessional				
Piggot, Ann Maria	Café Aide	Jefferson	9/1/2016	Resignation (of café aide position only)	Resignation of café aide position only. She will remain in transportation as per her letter.
Green, Brielle	Café Aide	Jefferson	9/1/2016	Resignation	
Smith, Kellon,	Instructional	CF	9/1/2016	Resignation	
Jo	Paraprofessional				
Dennis, Gabriell	Café Aide	Jefferson	9/1/2016	Resignation	

## P-4. APPROVE LEAVES

That the Board approve leaves for the following staff:

Name	Position	Location	Leave Dates	Leave Type Regarding updated info only.	Notes/ Corrections
Higgins, Kelly	Teacher- Elementary	CF	9/1/2016- 10/14/2016	Paid Medical Leave	
Reguinho, Jennifer	Teacher- Elementary	HC	11/4/2016- 1/16/2017	Paid Maternity Leave	
Steeb, Linda	Teacher-Mid. School	KMS	9/1/2016- 9/23/2016	Paid Medical Leave	
Romeo, Matthew	Teacher- Elementary	Jefferson	9/2/2016- 9/23/2016	Paid Medical Leave	Letter reflects 9/2/2016. Start of school year to be reflective of 9/1/2016

## P-5. APPROVE AGREEMENT BETWEEN BOE AND UTASA

That the Board approve the Agreement between the Board of Education and the Township of Union Association of School Administrators, for the period of September 1, 2014 through August 31, 2018, in accordance with the information appended to the minutes.

# P-9. APPROVE INTERIM SUPERVISOR OF OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE DEPARTMENT

That the Board approve Barry Loessel as Interim Supervisor of the Operations and Maintenance Department at a stipend amount of \$200 per day (for days worked only) effective September 1, 2016.

## P-10. APPROVE PRINCIPALS AND SUPERVISOR SALARIES

That the Board approve principals and supervisor salaries for the period of September 1, 2016 through August 31, 2017, in accordance with the information appended to the minutes.

## P-11. APPROVE CHANGE OF SALARY CLASS

That the Board approve Change of Salary Class (effective September 2016), in accordance with the information appended to the minutes.

#### DISCUSSION:

Mr. Le stated P-9 – how was the amount of \$200 per day determined? Mr. Tatum stated that is the amount we used when Mr. Vieira filled in the position before Mr. Brennan was hired and that seemed like a reasonable figure due to the amount of work that the individual would have to take on which includes taking on Board meetings and I think that is more than equitable amount of money.

Mr. Le stated I know we are trying to fill in Mr. Wiggins' successor, do we have a timeline on how long it will take to fill in that position. Mr. Tatum stated I will defer that to Mr. Brennan because he is in charge of that interview process. Mr. Brennan stated we received approximately 20 applications via Applitrak and we narrowed it down to five and next week we are going to hold interviews on Wednesday and Thursday. Mr. Nufrio stated can you elaborate on we? Mr. Brennan stated my department - myself and the Assistant Business Administrator, Manny, will be holding the first round of interviews and then we will send them to Mr. Tatum. Mr. Tatum stated they will send the finalists and I will have the Assistant Superintendent's involved and then the finalist will come to me.

Mr. Le stated do we feel confident that this person might be selected around the October or November meeting. Mr. Tatum stated I think that is doable timeline.

Mr. Le stated I know when we did the stipend for Manny we did a provision saying for a period from July to September. Mr. Tatum stated there is a reason for that because in Manny's case, he was taking over and he agreed that would be the time period that he would do it because effective July 1<sup>st</sup>, we no longer had a Business Administrator so at the goodness of his heart he agreed to stay on. Where in this case, we have an assistant supervisor who will fill that roll until

such time that a successor has been found so we have a little more in the way of time because let's go in another direction. Let's say we don't have a suitable recommendation, we still have to go about the business of operating the District and therefore we have a person in place that will continue until such time that we get a new person.

Mr. Le stated my main concern is if it takes more than 2-4 months, this will continue to accumulate the \$200 per day. Mr. Tatum stated but we are not paying a Supervisor right now and that is where the money is coming from and we are saving money.

Mr. Nufrio stated we hope that expediency will follow but certainly we are not going to rush the individuals that are going to conduct the interviews nor Mr. Tatum to bring someone just because we have to get this done. I think we can have confidence that it is going to be handled and handled efficiently and effectively. Mr. Tatum stated if we have a person that we want to recommend that comes to us from another school district, they will have to give notice. Again, we don't want to be without someone who is in charge of what is going on with our maintenance guys and projects. Mr. Brennan and Mr. Vieira have to worry about the finances and Mr. Brennan will be overseeing what is going on in the District as well but we have a gentleman that has been here for the development of all the projects and with the staff. No matter what happens, even if we hire another Supervisor, Barry is going to be an integral part.

Mr. Nufrio stated let's all remember, the authority rests with the Superintendent when it comes to any personnel matters. Mr. Tatum stated I wish more people would recognize that. Mr. Nufrio stated it is always the Superintendent that makes that final recommendation. The only power we have is to say "yes", "no" or "abstain" and "present not voting".

AYE: Mr. Arminio, Dr. Francis, Mr. Le, Mr. McDowell, Mr. Monge, Mrs. Regis-Darby, Mr. Salcedo, Mrs. Zuena, Mr. Nufrio

NAY: None

ABSTAIN: None

MOTION CARRIED

Mr. Nufrio stated on behalf of the Board, Mr. Loessel, we wish you the best and hopefully you will continue to do the job that is expected of your position. Mr. Loessel stated I certainly will.

#### APPROVAL OF BILLS:

Bills will be presented for payment at next meeting.

## **UNFINISHED BUSINESS:**

Mr. Arminio stated this coming Saturday, September 17<sup>th</sup> at Beertemple Park, the 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Rumble at 1:00 p.m. – the alumni from Burnet against the alumni of Kawameeh and I umpire the game every year and I am totally fair.

September 24<sup>th</sup> – two events that are important – Union's Got Talent in the auditorium and the Union Street Fair.

September 25<sup>th</sup> is the 5K race – the Board of Education is part sponsor and it raises money for ALS and we had a kickoff and it was outstanding. We watched the Mayor on TV and what he says about ALS.

September 22<sup>nd</sup> – Union Library, 7 p.m. – the Union Township Historical Society presentation of "Made in Union". A presentation that you will never see anywhere else.

September 21<sup>st</sup> – the State School Board's Association is having the County meeting at the Westwood. It is on communications. We certainly need a little bit of work in developing communication skills. I have already signed up. Mr. Nufrio stated I did too. If you wish to go please let Mr. Brennan or Mrs. Cappiello know.

Mr. Arminio stated one last thing, last Friday Union won its first opening football game v Watchung Hills 40-13. Awesome start. Mr. Nufrio stated congratulations to the kids and coaches. The announcer is known by his special voice and I think that is your cousin. Mr. Arminio is the announcer and he does it gratis which is terrific too.

Mr. Monge stated on Friday, the Union Parents for Special Education, which is our District's special education parent advisory group will be meeting on the 16<sup>th</sup> at Union High School in Room D244 from 6-8 p.m. For those that don't know, our District is mandated to support special need parent advisory group and with the help of Mrs. Conti's Department of Special Services, this is group is made up of parents that are trying to come together and share resources and bringing speakers and things to that nature. Elsie Macki is going to be running the group. I think we have about 20 parents or so interested. There will be a notice that is going to be sent around. Mrs. Conti stated already processed. Mr. Monge stated thank you to everyone for supporting this. I will report how it went.

#### NEW BUSINESS:

Dr. Francis stated Jeff had pointed this out so I will mention it. In the New Jersey Monthly, the top 100 high schools – Union jumped 40 spots from 201 to 161 for the past two years. Mr. Tatum stated there is a press release being put together for that same purpose.

Mr. Nufrio stated this Board has been hands on for quite some time now and I guess this is one fruit from the tree that we hope will produce more. I am never satisfied with one fruit.

Union Got Talent program coming up — one of our Board members was extremely unselfish in his act and he paid for the ad on behalf of the Board of Education and I will let you figure out who that person might be - another unselfish act by Mr. Arminio. If you want to reimburse him by all means but then we will have to take the complement back.

Mrs. Zuena stated I know that there is a new program put in place in the high school. Mr. Lowery was supposed to come tonight to discuss it and I guess he couldn't make it. Mr. Tatum stated he was asked not to come. Mrs. Zuena stated a lot of different people have contacted me parents and Board members.

I don't understand a program is put into place where parents weren't notified about it. All the communication went through the children and it may be a fabulous program but I think there is a lot of miscommunication that is involved with the program. To call down a bunch of kids and tell them tomorrow mandatorily you have to start study hall or you can't play sports is a pretty big message that is sent home with a child and that is the message that was sent home with my child. It could be great, but at the same time when there are different things that are happening and people don't know that their children are going to come home an hour later from school, it is extending the day of the coaches, the children, the trainer, the facility people, the people that have to clean the classrooms, the janitors — it just needed to be communicated and put together a little bit better. My son doesn't happen to have any problems studying or doing his homework so in his eyes it is a punishment to have to sit for an hour and told that if you don't have work, bring something else and bring something to do.

There is not a tutor there, there is nobody there to help them. In some cases, they may be doodling on a piece of paper for an hour. There is a tutoring program that is in place in our school that I think the children would get much more benefit out of if they are struggling with grade point averages and other things in order to play sports rather than sitting in a room basically with their coach but acting as a babysitter more or less.

There are a lot of different things. Kids are being pulled out of gym class now to do weightlifting where they could be pulled out of gym class to do study hall – that is what other towns are doing like Westfield, Cranford – they are giving up their gym periods and sending the children to study hall so they can do their homework or get tutoring done at that time. Not saying that it is not a fabulous thing and it could have a lot of good things that go to it, I just think the communication which we talked about. Mrs. Darby stated and how it was rolled out to the students, I don't think it was effective at all because my son came home with some of the same issues like Nancy said, my son is at the high school and we chose to send him to the high school. Mr. Nufrio stated you are going in to an area of personnel. Mr. Griggs stated that is a personnel discussion and you need to take it to the Superintendent. Mr. Tatum stated thank you.

Mr. Nufrio stated Mr. Tatum, myself and Mr. Griggs spoke at length this afternoon and Mr. Tatum wisely made the choice to forego the presentation this evening and ultimately it is Mr. Tatum's purview to decide whether something is has been flushed out enough or if it is going to be carried out but certainly we understand the situation but I think any further discussion of this is going to put us in a precarious situation about personnel.

Mr. Tatum stated many of you got phone calls, I did not. A lot of communication that goes around this District unfortunately goes on and the channels are not being observed properly. That is No. 1. This afternoon I made a call to the UTEA President and I invited her to the office and we had a nice conversation about this issue and we intend on sitting down and trying to flush out the whole aspect of it. I will be sitting down with Mr. Lowery tomorrow and I made a call to him to talk to him a little bit about this whole thing. I want to hear the version that he gives not to say when the children came and told you is true or not true but I would like to hear from the building principal. There are some things that we can hopefully work out but unfortunately many times in this District, communication is going on and I said this to Ann Margaret this afternoon, they fail to involve the Superintendent in the discussion and that is something that

needs to stop. I said this one time before, the staff is too comfortable to pick up the phone and start talking to the Board of Education members about their Superintendent's office and that is something that as we move forward, I think it has been said at this table before, you have to refer that to this office. You can't be there and having all these different side bars about what should and shouldn't happen until I have had an opportunity to investigate it and bring it back together and with the support of the Teacher Association who really has some pertinent issues. We discussed this this afternoon and we intend to hammer out some things. Ann Margaret was very gracious in terms of trying to work along with us during the month of September and moving forward we will come up with a plan that is equitable for the students.

The bottom line is this, the whole purpose of this is to help children in the academics. Remember the principal in the summer was very unsettled about the student achievement in the building with the test scores and he went back and devised a plan and really wanted to put something in place that would help children in the academics – sports and all that other stuff is great but at the end of the day what we want is to develop good sportsmen and academic scholars as well. We shouldn't put one before the other. We should do it simultaneously because without the two, they are not going to be able to move forward to college. I'm from Roselle and a lot of good athletes come through the Roselle school system but unfortunately they didn't have the support of the school system behind them to get them into good schools so the talents went to waste and they pretty much faltered and we are trying to avoid that. The real premise behind this whole thing is never to make a circumstance for teachers, children and parents – it is to take those students and move them forward. Sometimes we get a little ambitious and trying to get things done and I am guilty of that myself at times. But by the same token it is the desire to make things better and everyone in this room has the same commitment. We are talking the same language but going about it in different manners. It is about communicating with one another and I think unfortunately battle lines were drawn long before the principal occupied that chair at the high school and it time to throw our weapons down and start working together for the students. I'm getting frustrated and I'm tired of this kind of action going on because we are supposed to be for the children and we are not here to fight one another. We are here to do things and work together and do the best for everyone.

Mrs. Zuena stated I don't have a problem with that but can we not put the program in place until we iron it out. If we are going to iron it out why did the program start already? Mr. Tatum stated I need to have an opportunity to look into that. I took a step back because I was waiting for someone to bring the program and concerns to me but there is communication that goes on again and again we circumvent the Superintendent of Schools so now the question comes to me and I'm the responsible party but why is it done this way? Why are things going on in the District? Why do the people feel the need that this office should not be involved in the discussions that they have on the outside but then we come to this table and it is a problem. This could have been ironed out before it got to a situation where there was a program in place. If this discussion was held prior to this and if people picked up the phone and said hey there is an issue but I get it when it is in the paper form and unfortunately when there is an action and that is not what we are here for.

Mrs. Zuena stated we are going to keep the program running even though things have not been settled? Mr. Griggs stated he has to do some research and report back to the Board. Mrs.

Zuena stated but the program started today. Mr. Griggs stated I got it. He can probably update you tomorrow and that is my point. He will talk to the principal and have an opportunity to get answers. Mr. Tatum stated anything that is in place I do have the authority to pre-empt it if necessary. Right now the UTEA is willing to work with me for the month of September as we are trying to get this thing together but again in all fairness we have to have an opportunity to sit with the principal to investigate this a little bit more and to try to do a better job of communicating the information to everyone because we could have had him come tonight and make a presentation before the Board but I'm reacting to really what is hearsay to me because I don't have any facts to back up anything other than the discussion I had with Ann Margaret this afternoon so that is where we are.

Mr. Nufrio stated the key word is protocol and that applies to everyone. I can't stress that enough and I think I am fatigued at trying to stress opening that the protocol is very simple. A staff member has a problem, there is only one person they should be talking to and that is the Superintendent. If they choose to talk to a Board member that is on them but certainly it does confuse the entire issue and circumvents the process. We are about process. We keep stressing process. We keep stressing transparency. I am going to openly again urge everyone at this table and possibly the staff that is here, he is the boss. We gave him this position. We authorized him to make those decisions. I would certainly encourage a Board member or anyone, if you do hear something, the first response should be "have you spoken to the Superintendent", even if it was brought to my attention. This District and I'm not impugning the District, you can't impugn an entity but you can impugn the actions of an entity, I learned quickly that too many things were being done according to old fashion and old ways and that is going to change and I certainly support Mr. Tatum that if he messes up, he knows it is on him; but we gave him the authority that is endowed to the Superintendent to make those decisions. We have to have the confidence as the staff needs to have the confidence that if they do something, they need to check with him first. I am not going to go any further on who didn't do the checking that is on Mr. Tatum to learn and discern what exactly occurred. I can't address the staff because that is unethical. I will leave that up to him. I can address this Board and remind us all – if we hear something, bring it to the Superintendent or have that individual say "call the Superintendent".

Dr. Francis stated when a building administrator creates programs that are not favorable to the parents or to the students – I know you are supposed to go to the Superintendent to discuss their issue or concerns, but are they allowed to create programs on their own without first seeking your approval? Mr. Tatum stated if this was in the confine of the day, normal protocol is that they should run it by me but the principal is in charge of the school and the issue here is more timing than anything. I know that many times as a building principal I would create a program along with a group of teachers and it was within the confines of the day and I wouldn't take it up with the Superintendent to do those things because as the building principal by law, I am the person who has the legal authority to oversee that particular unit. Once I step out and I will give you an example of when I was building principal, there was a particular type of schedule that I wanted to create and I was new to the District and I did it in my last district, I called the Superintendent and said I need to know based upon the contract whether or not the unassigned times whether or not I could utilize the staff members for other activities that I would like to do in the building and the response to me was you are the building principal. Any time that is within the confines of the contract is yours so therefore you can go ahead and if you want

to have teachers involved in a study hall at the elementary level, I was able to do that. If I wanted to have something after school, if I found the resources to do it, the Superintendent would not stand in my way. Here in Union which is pretty much a commuter school where everyone came on buses so then I would need the support of the Superintendent's office if I needed to add a late bus but that would be the parameters in which I would need to seek the Superintendent's approval.

Mr. Nufrio stated as a Board member I can certainly understand the question and it is a legitimate one but this is a profession where we have so many guidelines and parameters and pre-requisites so to answer that would be I guess the right word would be should any and all administrators and I'm speaking as a Board member, as I said before, should always consult with a Board member and this is the way it should be done. Is it always done that way, if it was then we wouldn't be talking about this. Had Mr. Tatum been properly notified by anyone, by the right protocol I think I have enough confidence in this guy that he would have made the right decision but he still wouldn't have made the decision until he would have checked with Paul and possibly me and the whole Board ultimately. Some issues don't need to come before the Board, some can be resolved in the office but the problem is it doesn't always get to his office until three days later.

Mr. Monge stated districtwide calendars and this happened the last two years, we have open houses happening and PTA meetings that have been set during the same time as our Board meetings are going on. Is there anyone who actually is in charge of that and offers a message by all means necessary trying to please schedule around Board of Ed meetings so that we can actually attend. Mr. Nufrio stated both Mrs. Zuena and I sent an email addressing that exact issue because Mr. Tatum was astute enough to recall that we had this conversation but the thing is that I don't know.

Mr. Tatum stated of all the years I sat in the principal chair, the PTA was the one who scheduled the open houses and what they try to do is get together at the liaison's home and we would sit and plan on our schedule for the entire year. Sometimes that would happen over the summer time but what would happen is that sometimes despite that there are other issues that come up and then they will make a change. But the problem comes in when they try to accommodate another school because of cross population of siblings and I think what happened this year, maybe the message we gave last year to the building principals should have been given to the PTAs that perhaps they can stay away from Tuesday night because Board members would like to attend and Mrs. Moses, Mr. Benaquista and I we have started trying to work with the liaisons a little bit and keep up to date on PTA business. I think moving forward that we need to communicate with Mrs. Lazarus. Mrs. Moses stated I think that is what we will do is speak with the District PTA President moving forward and I was also thinking that once they do it which is August, then we need to look at it and put it on the group calendar so everyone can see it and finalize it so everyone can see it and comment on it. The calendar that we had there was only one school that was tonight and that was Battle Hill and now there is three. Mr. Tatum stated talking about seeking approval, we heard about the change when we heard it from you guys for Washington.

Dr. Francis stated same thing when they have the National Honor Society, can they inform us to give us an opportunity to attend and not tell us last minute. Mr. Nufrio stated I heard from some Board members that they weren't informed of some events. Mr. Tatum stated at Thursday's principal meeting we will ask for a calendar of events that is indeed solidified and that calendar will then be submitted to the Board. The group that I have been meeting with for the last two weeks on public relations, we talked about a District calendar of events and we want to start covering some of those events and giving them some press. We will correct this problem and it is a communication error that we need to work on and certainly we will hopefully have that for you so we can move forward. When there is something like a National Honor Society – a formal invitation should go out to each Board member.

Mr. Nufrio stated it compels us all to check our emails and sometimes we are negligent. Nobody is perfect and for those people that were not aware of the districtwide get together which was at the high school and Mr. McDowell said he was not informed of that, the only thing I can say is we have to fix it. As a former administrator, I didn't expect the PTA to schedule my open house, I did it.

## COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC:

Ann Margaret Shannon stated isn't there a way on School Dude if you put a meeting on for that date you can block anybody else. Mrs. Zuena stated the open houses don't go through School Dude. Mrs. Moses stated they do it over the summer, they book all their events on School Dude. Mr. Tatum stated isn't it specific to the facility so I think that is the problem. Mr. Monge stated you are going down Google road. Mrs. Paul stated yes, you can use Google calendar.

Ms. Shannon stated the UTEA is all about academics and athletics but we were very disappointed as he was because we were not in the loop at all. We found out from Mr. Lowery but not until Thursday. I will work harder to communicate with you and the Board and I hope the whole district will consider that. I can't wake up in the middle of the night and say wow I wonder what program will be happening in high school that I need to ask about. We found out when all the other teachers and coaches found out and I think that was where the trouble was and it is miscommunication. We are going to work with you on communications.

Mrs. Susan Lipstein stated I was thrilled about our going up in the rankings in the high school and as I said I think it is the Board supporting the Superintendent and going back to the staff and teachers need to be commended. It takes a village and the staff and the parents.

A question about Effective Solutions, will there be people in the District and how many days will they be there. I really think it is a great plan and I think what is done in a therapeutic schools can be done in a public school because people know what they are doing and that will eliminate a lot of parent anxiety that they know that there are experts there. I know there is a meeting Friday and I think it is a great thing to offer more services because it brings us a much better support system. Therapeutic schools are used for a lot of reasons and it is sometimes the parents that ask for it. If you have the services, then you are going to be spending not only the tuition but the legal fees.

Put on your calendars, May 18<sup>th</sup> is the Education Foundation reception.

Mrs. Monge stated I have a question regarding the ChromeBooks, I was at a PTA meeting at the high school, along with the study hall for the athletes prior to their games, it was announced that the ChromeBooks will be rolling out by February and it was for grades 9-12. Is that correct? Mrs. Moses stated yes.

#### MOTION FOR EXECUTIVE SESSION:

Moved by Mrs. Zuena, seconded by Dr. Francis, that the Board go into Executive Session to discuss the following subject matters without the presence of the public in accordance with the provisions of N.J.S.A. 10:4-2(b) residency matters. The Board will disclose the discussion conducted during the Executive Session with notice to the public when the disclosure will not result in unwarranted invasion of individual privacy or prejudice to the best interest of the Board of Education and provided that such disclosure does not violate federal, state or local statutes and does not fall within the attorney-client privilege. All present voting Yes. MOTION CARRIED

Dr. Francis left prior to start of Executive Session - 10:45 p.m.

The Board returned to public session at 11:15 p.m.

## MOTION TO ADJOURN:

There being no further business before the Board in public session it was moved by Mr. Le, seconded by Mr. Arminio, that the meeting be adjourned at 11:15 p.m. All present voting YES. MOTION CARRIED

REPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,

GREGORY E. BRENNAN BOARD SECRETARY